

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
ZONING AND PLANNING COMMISSION
CITY OF LADUE, ST. LOUIS COUNTY, MISSOURI
WEDNESDAY OCTOBER 28, 2015, 4:00 P.M.

Chairman Moore called the meeting of the Zoning and Planning Commission to order at 4:05 P.M. The following members were present:

Chairman McPherson Moore

Vice-Chair Thomas Kahn

Commissioner John Lochhead

Commissioner Margaret Holtman

Commissioner Tim Crowley

Commissioner Robbye Toft

Commissioner James Howe IV

Also present were Mayor Nancy Spewak, Anne Lamitola, Director of Public Works, Michael Gartenberg, Zoning and Planning Official, Will Penney, Building Official, and Vicki Gant, Building Clerk.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairman Moore asked if there were any changes to the minutes of the September 23, 2015 meeting. Commissioner Crowley moved to approve the minutes and it passed unanimously.

Chairman Moore asked if anyone had other business in addition to the agenda subject of the proposed amended Special Use permit for MICDS and no one came forward.

Commissioner Margaret Holtman stated she is recusing herself from the remainder of the meeting.

PUBLIC FORUM

Anne Lamitola gave a brief overview of the outline for the meeting with regard to the independent reviews that the City obtained for Sound, Storm water, & Landscaping. She also provided a summary of the balloon demonstrations held at MICDS to demonstrate the mass and scale of the proposed stadium improvements.

Russ Olsen of Henderson Engineering (City independent reviewer), reviewed the report from Accousticontrol (MICDS sound consultant). He stated the report was thorough and the equipment used was adequate. He stated the results meet the St. Louis noise ordinance and levels were below the requirements. He stated he believed the sound levels would not change significantly from what has been experienced currently on the MICDS property. He stated that if the new stadium is constructed, Tealbrook residents will essentially experience what the Maryhill residents have experienced emitting from Ellis Field, where football games are currently taking place.

Vice-Chairman Kahn asked if Mr. Olsen's numbers were figured from averages and Russ Olsen responded that they were because that is the procedure outlined in the St. Louis County noise ordinance.

Jim Holtrop from Accousticontrol responded by saying he only recorded during the game, he did not record before or after because it was quieter during those times. He stated that he wanted to determine the actual impact of the sound on neighbors.

Vice-Chairman Kahn asked if the adjustment of the speakers at a lower level would make an impact.

Russ Olsen stated announcements over the speakers may decrease the noise levels; crowd noise will not be impacted by the sound system.

Commissioner Toft asked if he had re-visited any noise studies he had preformed and how accurate they were.

Russ Olsen stated he had and that they were fairly accurate.

Commissioner Toft asked if the City received complaints later what could be done.

Russ Olsen stated there are mitigation methods that could be employed to reduce noise.

Commissioner Toft asked if removing the retaining wall and replacing it with an iron railing by MICDS would increase the sound level on Tealbrook.

Russ Olsen stated the wall would have to be taller than the elevation of the noise source in order to be effective.

Commissioner Toft asked if vegetation was a good sound barrier.

Russ Olsen stated it was not.

Paul Reitz of Reitz & Jens (City independent reviewer) gave his report on how the new stadium would affect storm water. He stated that MSD requirements ensure that there could not be an increase in the volume of storm water draining from the site. He stated that maintenance would be imperative to preventing any storm water issues. He also stated there were no issues with the design.

Commissioner Crowley asked who has responsibility if storm water issues occur on the property after MSD and the City's independent consultant approve the project.

Paul Reitz explained there is no easy answer and there is always a possibility for storm water issues to occur. He stated that MICDS is the property owner and responsible for documented issues attributed to their property and that MSD could later require additional storm water retention.

Chairman Moore asked for clarifications with regard to the Operational and Maintenance manual. Paul Reitz stated the document has been provided and will be required by MSD. Maintenance of the storm water BMP's is required to ensure the storm water system functions properly.

Chairman Moore asked how far upstream Pebble Creek begins.

Paul Reitz explained that it started at Monsanto.

Brandon Harp of CEDC reiterated Paul Reitz's review and gave more clarification of the MICDS storm water concerns. He stated that approximately 240 acres drain to the MICDS property from upstream.

Anne Lamitola gave an update on the storm water issues from the neighbors of Tealbrook and & Maryhill meeting. She also gave a brief description of mock balloon demonstration. Chairman Moore asked Lisa Lyle if the information given by Anne Lamitola was an accurate summary. Lisa Lyle replied yes.

Randy Martis with Landscape Technologies (MICDS landscape architect) provided an update on the actions since the last meeting. The plan was modified slightly based on the City's comments. He gave explanation of the further modifications made in response to the landscape coordination meeting held on October 27, 2015.

Laurel Harrington of Christner (City reviewer) responded by saying the overall landscaping has been approved and there were just a few more small minor details to work out.

Chairman Moore asked if there were any outstanding issues.

Laurel Harrington replied that there were no major concerns, only tree placement details to work out with regard to preserving existing buffer vegetation.

Vice-Chairman Kahn asked if the landscaping would provide a reasonable buffer for the neighbors of Tealbrook.

Laurel Harrington replied with all the layers of plant material that it would.

Chairman Moore moved the discussion to the proposed use of the field (quantity of games, hospitality pavilion, club sports, and location of games on the campus).

Josh Smith, Athletic Director for MICDS, explained that there would be no change in the total number of games played through the weekday on the property as a whole. Games played on the weekend would start later and end earlier. The contests played on the new field would be fall soccer and football and in the spring would consist

of soccer and lacrosse. Anne Lamitola asked if there would be practices on the field. Josh Smith replied yes. Anne Lamitola asked how many times a year are two games played at once. Josh Smith replied four times a year.

Chairman Moore stated that at the last meeting a resident asked why MICDS need to amend their special use permit and why this hearing was taking place. Chairman Moore asked John Maupin, City Attorney, to explain. John Maupin explained that there was no specific ordinance/zoning category for a school. These hearings are held to protect residents. The Zoning & Planning Commission will listen to each side; make their recommendation to approve/disapprove the proposed project to the City Council. The City Council is the entity that holds the official Public Hearing and votes to amend or adopt special use permits.

Chairman Moore asked residents if they had questions or concerns regarding the sound studies performed.

Susan Hibbard, 16 N Tealbrook, asked if the topography was taken into consideration when the sound study was performed

Russ Olsen stated it was and that there was nothing in the topography that gives him any indication that the sound will be louder based on the topography of the area.

Anne Parker, 9 S Tealbrook, asked how many spectators the sound study was based on and where the new sound system existed.

Russ Olsen stated that they recorded a game of around 400 to 500 people. They also had a recording from Kansas City of 3000 people and reduced the number of decibels by the industry standard methodology. This would give the readings when the stadium is at full capacity.

Jim Holtrop explained that the new speakers would reduce the noise levels by seven (7) decibels. The new speakers can be set at a sound level that is not above the noise ordinance and then locked so no one can adjust it.

Commissioner Lochhead asked if seven (7) decibels was clearly noticeable.

Jim Holtrop answered it would be.

Lisa Lyle stated MICDS had submitted reports that illustrate that the noise ordinance is being met by the system they have submitted, and they are contemplating a superior sound system. Ms. Lyle asked if it would be possible to write the SUP with the current information with the understanding that MICDS could submit a better solution to the sound issue later.

Debbie Goss, 21 Maryhill, asked if the bass drum was no longer being played at the games as she has noticed a decrease in bass drums.

Lisa Lyle explained that the drum is not played at every game.

Jim Holtrop stated that the drum was not played at the first game he recorded but was present at the second game recorded.

Russ Olsen stated that drum was present when he recorded sound levels.

Ted Doering, attorney representing one of the residents, asked if a sound study was recorded with two games being played at once or a playoff game.

Both sound engineers answered there had been one game being played on the property when they recorded sound levels.

Ted Doering asked if the noise ordinance would be exceeded if two games were played simultaneously.

Jim Holtrop answered that the sound levels of both games he recorded measured below the noise ordinance, but that he was uncertain what would occur during two games played simultaneously.

Josh Smith stated that MICDS has not hosted a playoff game in four years.

Ted Doering asked if the sound limiters on the new sound system could be changed.

Jim Holtrop answered yes.

Ted Doering asked how sound levels for this system are known when the project has not been constructed.

Jim Holtrop stated that the report is based on models that provide for conservative projections.

Brad Goss, 21 Maryhill, asked if the plans show the location of the speakers.

Anne Lamitola answered yes.

Russ Olsen stated the speakers would be pointed out toward the field, not towards neighbors.

Becky Jennings, 17 Maryhill, expressed her feelings on why MICDS should be able to build the stadium.

A letter was read from the residents of 9808 Countryside in favor of the MICDS stadium build.

Carl Hogan, 14 S Tealbrook, made a statement he was concerned about privacy due to the height of the stadium.

Lawrence Mayer, 20 S Tealbrook, played a recording of a soccer game to demonstrate the noise level from games.

Russ Olsen responded by saying it was difficult to judge because the recording was played on an amplifier.

Anne Parker, 9 S Tealbrook, asked if there would be a speaker for the hospitality building.

Lisa Lyle answered no.

Ken Bush, 11 N Tealbrook, asked if the stadium could be built out of a sound absorbing material. He also felt the stadium being built near Tealbrook would bring the real estate value down for adjoining properties.

Nick Niknejadi, 18 S Tealbrook, expressed his disagreement about the value of the stadium.

Chairman Moore asked the residents if they had questions or concerns regarding storm water.

Susan Hibbard, 16 N Tealbrook, stated that she met with MSD along with Anne Parker because of an erosion issue being caused by a black pipe and artificial field.

Brandon Harp, civil engineer for MICDS, responded by saying the pipe has been modified and is located entirely on the MICDS property.

Paul Reitz, independent civil engineer for the City, stated that concentrating all the water through one small area, such as a pipe, creates an erosion problem.

Becky Jennings, 17 Maryhill, made a statement that MICDS accepts responsibility for any problems that may arise. She states that they have always been a good neighbor and care.

Anne Parker, 9 S Tealbrook, asked how long the bio retention area would hold the water before releasing it. She was concerned about mosquitoes.

Brandon Harp explained that the bio retention area would hold two (2) feet of water and then release per day.

Commissioner Crowley asked when the last time a basement was flooded in Tealbrook.

Susan Hibbard, 16 N Tealbrook, answered 2013 & 2014.

Anne Lamitola states she would continue to follow up with MSD to determine those dates and what MSD has done to resolve the sanitary sewer issues.

Brad Goss, 21 Maryhill, felt a regular maintenance schedule of the field should be written in the SUP.

Julie Lily, Chairman of MICDS, made a request for the vote to be made at the next Zone & Planning meeting.

Karen Kalinowski, Board of Trustee member of MICDS, stated that there were long discussions of the best location for the stadium and submitted the plan they felt was the best one for the property.

Chairman Moore asked if any residents had any questions or concern regarding the landscaping.

Susan Hibbard, 16 S Tealbrook, asked if all the landscaping would be evergreens.

Randy Martis stated ninety percent would be evergreens.

Anne Parker, 9 S Tealbrook, felt the need for new plans to be submitted showing Nick Niknejadi's property at an angle.

Anne Lamitola asked Randy Martis to explain how the plans would look if they were to re-submit with these changes.

Randy Martis commented that it would be very similar to the plans that were already submitted.

Brad Goss, 21 Maryhill, made the statement that if the hospitality building was lowered, you would not see it from Maryhill. The net that is always up will be seen from Tealbrook and is not visually appealing.

Chairman Moore announced that the next meeting of the Zoning & Planning Commission would be Wednesday, November 18, 2015 at 4:00 pm.

Vice Chairman Kahn moved to adjourn the meeting and the motion unanimously passed.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:14 P.M.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "McPherson Moore". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above a horizontal line.

McPherson Moore, Chairman

